International Center for Advocates Against Discrimination 706 Riverside Dr., Suite 9D

New York, NY 10031



info@icaadglobal.org Tel: +1 (917) 971-5713 Fax: +1 (646) 807-4647 www.icaadglobal.org

### United Nations Human Rights Council Universal Periodic Review: Italy

# Submission of the International Center for Advocates Against Discrimination (ICAAD) 20<sup>th</sup> session of the UPR Working Group, Oct/ Nov 2014

March 14, 2014

#### Authors, Researchers, Editors

Jaspreet Singh Hansdeep Singh Anika J. Hermann International Center for Advocates Against Discrimination (ICAAD) 706 Riverside Dr., Suite 9D New York, NY 10031

# For More Information Contact

Hansdeep Singh, Esq., Co-Founder, Director of Legal Programs hansdeep@icaadglobal.org +1-(917) 971-5713

Jaspreet Singh, Esq., Co-Founder, Director of Policy & Advocacy jaspreet@icaadglobal.org +1-(404) 319-9988

Website: www.icaadglobal.org

Our Recommendations Are Endorsed By the Italian Based NGO: Famiglie Arcobaleno (Associazone Genitori Omosessuali)

#### United Nations Human Rights Council Universal Periodic Review: Italy

#### **Executive Summary**

Drawing on ICAAD's research, this submission highlights issues of structural discrimination that impact women and minorities. The research examines Italy's compliance with its international human rights obligations, covering: women in the labor market, violence against women, human trafficking, and unfair treatment of Roma, Sinti, and Travellers, the LGBT community, and migrants and refugees.

### (I) About International Center for Advocates Against Discrimination (ICAAD)

(1) ICAAD uses a systems approach to combat structural discrimination against women and minorities globally. We identify gaps in the societal structures that marginalize vulnerable communities using a transdisciplinary approach that combines law, technology, and art. Our evidence based research utilizes teams of experts to identify specific structural discrimination policies, marshal resources and key partnerships, and provide strategic support of local NGOs with the aim of systematically uprooting discrimination within different societal sectors (e.g., legislative, judicial, law enforcement, health, faith, etc.).

### (II) Women's Rights Issues

### (A) Women in the Labor Market

### (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(2) Despite Italy's acceptance of Recommendation No. 54 from Cuba regarding gender equality in the labor market,<sup>1</sup> Italian women continue to face an uphill battle for equality in the workforce. The prohibition on discrimination based on sex in employment in Article 27 of Legislative Decree no. 198 of 11 April 2006 remains ineffective as systematic discrimination manifests itself in a variety of ways. The Italian Ministry for Labor and Social Policies highlights that Italian women's opportunities in the labor market are hampered mainly by structural problems.<sup>2</sup> Particular problems include a lack of tools to promote effective work-life balance practices, a lack of assistance for working parents (e.g. nursery schools), cultural factors, and implicit discrimination (e.g. the labor market valuing characteristics more prevalent among men, even though not significant for the job).<sup>3</sup>

(3) The presence of women in the labor market is concentrated in less stable, low-wage sectors, and even when they are participating in higher-wage, male-dominated sectors, women remain underrepresented in senior positions such as management. Unemployment is also gender-skewed, especially in the southern regions of the country. In 2012, the gender gap in the employment rate was 19% among people aged 15-64.<sup>4</sup> For these reasons, among others, a significant gender wage gap (around  $6.7\%^5$ ) persists in Italy.<sup>6</sup>

# (2) State Response:

(4) With the aim of promoting female presence in leadership positions, in 2011, Italy passed Law No. 120/2011, which requires listed companies and subsidiaries of public bodies to ensure at least 20% of the less represented gender in the first renewal of the boards, and 33% in the second renewal, for three terms.<sup>7</sup>.

(5) In 2012, Italy passed Law No. 92/2012 ("Reform of the Labor Market") with the aim of promoting female stable employment. In particular, the law incentivized companies to hire women of any age who have been unemployed for at least twenty-four months.<sup>8</sup> The law also introduced measures to combat the sadly widespread practice of the so-called "blank resignations," where, among others, female recruits are asked to sign a blank resignation letter which can be enforced by the employer whenever he or she desires (such as when the woman becomes pregnant). From 2008-2009, approximately 800,000 mothers stated that in the course of their working lives they had been laid off or were forced to resign during or following a pregnancy.<sup>9</sup>

### (3) Remaining Challenges:

(6) While a laudable effort, Law No. 92/2012 has been implemented only to a limited extent. The law contributed to the hiring of almost 14,000 women over the recent months.<sup>10</sup> However, the law, criticized as an amalgamation of confusing, intersecting regulations, has actually increased flexibility in termination, particularly for small businesses.<sup>11</sup>

(7) Discrimination also persists in other policies at the institutional level. For example, welfare cuts and a lack of funding for nursery schools<sup>12</sup> has caused many women to move into a "free caretaker role," exacerbating existing inequality in the labor market.<sup>13</sup>

#### (4) Recommendation:

(8) Italy must align its policies and practices with its obligations under international law<sup>14</sup> by implementing specific legislative changes, such as closing loopholes in lax termination regulations, increasing funding for nursery schools, and by instituting educational programs to raise awareness of gender segregation across and within employment sectors.

#### (B) Violence Against Women

#### (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(9) Violence against women, in particular sexual violence, persists at staggering levels in Italy, despite Italy having accepted Israel's Recommendation No. 93 regarding gender-based violence.<sup>15</sup> Largely a result of the cultural norm of "machismo," in which men perceive pride and honor from hyper-masculine, dominating behaviors, violence against women continues to permeate the country due to the absence of a national plan to combat gender-based violence.<sup>16</sup> In 2006 the Italian National Institute for Statistics (ISTAT) carried out the first national survey on gender-based violence. The survey highlighted that nearly 4,000,000 women in Italy suffered physical violence (18.8%), while 5,000,000 were victims of sexual violence (23.7%). Moreover, according to a report of an Italian non-profit association *Casa delle Donne per non subire violenza* (based in Bologna) which collects and analyzes the data found in the press relating cases of *femicide* committed in Italy

in the course of a year, in 2012, 126 women were killed and 74 more murders were attempted. The report shows that 59% of cases occurred in the context of a relationship—in progress or terminated—between the victim and the murderer. In 40% of cases the victim had been abused (psychologically, physically, by means of sexual violence or stalking) prior to the *femicide*.

### (2) State Response:

(10) In response, Italy issued Law Decree No. 93 of 2013, converted into Law No. 119 of 15 October 2013, which amends the criminal code and criminal procedure code to create stricter penalties for attacks on pregnant women and minors, and to provide free legal aid for all victims of violence. It also makes it more difficult for women to withdraw complaints, which they frequently do for fear of their accusers, and tasks the Department of Equal Opportunities with the creation of an Extraordinary Plan (the "**Plan**") to combat gender-based and sexual violence.<sup>17</sup> The Plan aims, *inter alia*, at preventing gender-based and sexual violence through campaigns to raise public awareness, education and training activities in schools, better measures for supporting women victims of violence and their children, and the creation of a comprehensive data bank collecting data and information relating to cases of violence.

# (3) Remaining Challenges:

(11) Italy's response is insufficient, as Law No. 119/2013 indicates that the Plan must be implemented at no additional cost to public finances, clearly inhibiting execution of the strategy. For the financing the Plan, it is possible to have recourse to the Fund for Promoting Rights and Equal Opportunities (the "**Fund**"). To this end, the Fund was increased by  $\notin$ 10 million for 2013,  $\notin$ 7 million for 2014, and  $\notin$ 10 million for each year from 2015. Much needs to be done, as shelters remain overcrowded and underfunded. <sup>18</sup> Moreover, it is doubtful that the allocated resources will suffice for education and training activities in schools.<sup>19</sup>

(12) Italy also lacks initiatives to give any teeth to its prohibitions against discrimination based on ethnicity, such as Legislative Decree No. 215/2003. This disproportionately impacts females of disadvantaged ethnic groups such as the Roma and Sinti populations, as they face a culture of "double discrimination."<sup>20</sup>

# (4) Recommendation:

(13) Italy must align its policies and practices with its obligations under international law<sup>21</sup> by implementing *well-funded* plans to combat gender-based violence at the local level.

# (C) Human Trafficking

#### (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(14) Although Italy's Law No. 228/2003 prohibits the trafficking of human beings, and despite the fact that Italy has accepted Recommendation No. 71 from the United States regarding trafficking victims,<sup>22</sup> human trafficking is a widespread problem in Italy. In fact, the number of identified or presumed victims of human trafficking in 2013 amounted to 2,381.<sup>23</sup> Women and children are particularly vulnerable to this contemporary form of slavery, based especially on sexual exploitation. Moreover, when trafficked women seek asylum, they usually do so without disclosing their status due to lack of knowledge about available assistance.<sup>24</sup>

### (2) State Response:

(15) To combat trafficking, Italy allows trafficked victims to seek special 6-month permits (renewable for a year or for a longer period if certain circumstances are met) for men and women whose safety is in danger under Legislative Decree No. 286/1998. This program is supplemented with social integration initiatives (e.g. access to the health service and registration in unemployment lists) for those who receive permits.<sup>25</sup>

### (3) Remaining Challenges:

(16) Italy's laudable victim-centered approach to combatting trafficking has suffered due to recent budget cuts.

(17) Even more problematically, initiatives to assist trafficking victims are severely undermined by the "Security Package Law" (Law No. 94/2009), which prohibits illegal migration into the country. In a culture of "illegal hunting," Italian law enforcement officials have resorted to charging women with illegal immigration (and crimes like prostitution) without asking the women whether or not they have been victims of trafficking. In fact, law enforcement officials have prosecuted trafficking victims for crimes of illegal immigration when they were committed *solely* as a result of being trafficked. Ultimately, police are not adequately trained in recognizing and appropriately responding to victims of trafficking.<sup>26</sup>

# (4) Recommendation:

(18) Italy must align its policies and practices with its obligations under international law<sup>27</sup> to combat the trafficking of human beings by training law enforcement officers to recognize victims of trafficking, explain the permits available to them, and ultimately prioritize the assistance of trafficking victims, particularly women and girls, over concerns regarding illegal migration.

# (III) Minority Rights Issues

# (A) Situation of Roma, Sinti, and Travellers (RSC)

# (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(19) Discrimination against RSC populations is extremely pervasive in Italian society, and many of the Recommendations that Italy has accepted pertain to this issue.<sup>28</sup> Xenophobic attacks are widespread and law enforcement officials tend to ignore or minimize these offenses. Political debates also tend to ignore these attacks unless they are particularly heinous.<sup>29</sup>

(20) In large cities, officials also forcibly evict RSC formal and informal settlements. This mass targeting of RSC populations in a government-declared "emergency" situation stands in stark contrast to the protection from discrimination based on language or race in the Italian Constitution.<sup>30</sup>

#### (2) State Response:

(21) The Italian government has responded to this dilemma by formulating a National Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma, Sinti and Travellers in February 2012. Furthermore, Italy has created a pilot project for the repatriation of RST persons living in camps.

# (3) Remaining Challenges:

(22) The commendable National Strategy has fallen short. Limited resources and a general climate of political disfavor within the central government have prevented implementation at local levels. Moreover, the "voluntary" repatriation program has been criticized as a means to remove these marginalized groups from the country.<sup>31</sup>

(23) Italy's anti-discrimination legislation has a disparate impact that exacerbates these problems. According to Law No. 482/1999, prohibiting discrimination against "linguistic minorities," excludes RSC from the definition of "linguistic minorities" by requiring stability and duration in a particular geographic region.

(24) Government officials have also remained dedicated to removing RSC at all costs. For example, officials have used a national "census" to find and evict RSC camps. The government has also appealed from a Regional Administrative Court (TAR) decision that found the government's "state of emergency" regarding RSC populations illegitimate. After the "state of emergency" was upheld by another TAR, the Council of State's judgment declared the "state of emergency" unfounded. <sup>32</sup> The government challenged this decision in front of the Italian Supreme Court, which in May 2013 upheld the judgment of the Council of State.<sup>33</sup>

# (4) Recommendation:

(25) Italy must align its policies and practices with its obligations under international law<sup>34</sup> by condemning and prosecuting violence against RSC, and amending Law No. 482/1999 to allow RSC to be considered "linguistic minorities."<sup>35</sup>

# (B) Situation of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender (LGBT) Community

# (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(26) Discriminatory attitudes with respect to sexual orientation and gender identity are prevalent in Italy. These attitudes marginalize the LGBT population, inhibit their access to equal employment, and lead to bias-motivated crimes. They also demean the rights of same-sex parents and their children, as same-sex couples are not provided with any kind of legal recognition. The Italian Constitution's absence of a prohibition on discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity perpetuates these problems.<sup>36</sup> Yet, Italy has accepted Recommendation No. 24 from the Netherlands to combat these issues.<sup>37</sup>

# (2) State Response:

(27) The Italian government has responded with public awareness campaigns such as "Refuse Homophobia" and "Take Down the Bully." Furthermore, in 2013, the Equal opportunities department and the National antidiscrimination bureau (UNAR) have agreed on a "National strategy to prevent and contrast discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity."<sup>38</sup> Legislative Decree No. 216/2003 has banned discrimination and harassment based on sexual orientation since 2003.

(28) Moreover, at a regional level, in early 2014 the Regional Assembly of Sicily (*Assemblea Regionale*) passed legislation<sup>39</sup> that allowed the Sicilian credit agency, Irfis, to sign mortgage agreements with the Cassa Depositi e Prestiti<sup>40</sup> for, among others, homosexual couples who have been in a registered civil union for at

least one year. However, the relevant provisions were then challenged before the Italian Constitutional Court on matters of funding, and they have ultimately been removed from the final piece of legislation that entered into force in late January 2014.<sup>41</sup>

# (3) Remaining Challenges:

(29) Although the public awareness campaigns are useful for the gay and lesbian populations (to the extent they are adequately funded), they do not include information to address transphobia. Therefore, they do not combat discriminatory attitudes against the entire LGBT population.<sup>42</sup> Moreover, schools are not yet prepared to acknowledge children of same-sex parents and teach family equality.

(30) A grave impediment to the protection of the LGBT community exists in Italy's criminal code. Prohibitions on hate speech do not currently cover homophobia. Additionally, bias-motivated crime laws do not cover homophobia or transphobia. Efforts to make these changes have been met with charges of unconstitutionality, namely that the lack of a definition of "sexual orientation" would violate the constitutional principle of "strict legality." Ultimately, these gaps in Italy's legislation lead to weaker sentences for persons who direct hateful violence toward LGBT persons.<sup>43</sup>

# (4) Recommendation:

(31) Italy must align its policies and practices with the principles embodied in international law<sup>44</sup> by implementing national plans to raise awareness of all forms of discriminatory attitudes and practices against members of the LGBT population and by amending its criminal code to prosecute hate crimes on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity. Moreover, it must forcefully apply the "National strategy", which is still largely undeployed, and give legal recognition to same-sex couples.

# (C) Situation of Migrants/Refugees

# (1) Systematic Discrimination:

(32) The "state of emergency" regarding immigration into Italy is a product of discriminatory attitudes against migrants, but it also sustains these attitudes and creates a culture where xenophobic violence is prevalent. This impacts both the RSC population and refugees from northern Africa, who frequently face discrimination and are targeted in xenophobic attacks. At the same time, Italy has accepted Recommendation No. 37 from Kyrgyzstan to implement its migration laws in a manner that accords with international standards.<sup>45</sup>

# (2) State Response:

(33) Italy has improved its immigration policies. Most notably, the crime of illegal immigration no longer carries a prison sentence except in cases of recidivism. Italy has also funneled government resources toward integration of migrant populations. For example, it has created a map of social services for migrants.<sup>46</sup> Moreover, 12 million Euros were recently allocated by the European Fund for the Integration of the non-European Immigrants (EIF) for projects promoting the employability of immigrants.

### (3) Remaining Challenges:

(34) A seemingly less restrictive immigration policy is undermined by certain details. For example, although illegal immigrants no longer face prison time except in cases of recidivism, Law No. 129/2011 increased the length of time they may lawfully be detained from six months to eighteen months.<sup>47</sup> Citizenship is also difficult to acquire; there is no facilitated route to citizenship for children born of foreign persons living in Italy.48

(35) Italy's behavior regarding migration from northern Africa, particularly from Libya, is inconsistent with international principles. On April 3, 2012, Italy entered into an Agreement with Libya to restrict migration, despite asylum-seekers and refugees being subject to deplorable human rights violations in Libya.<sup>49</sup> Even more alarmingly, Italy has utilized its military vessels to return persons found in international waters to Libya, even though many of them were asylum-seekers and refugees.<sup>50</sup>

### (4) Recommendation:

(36) Italy must align its policies and practices with the principles embodied in international law<sup>51</sup> by implementing its immigration policies in a manner that acknowledges the plight of asylum-seekers and refugees and treats migrants with dignity and respect.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), Database of UPR Recommendations: Italy (2010), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/database/</u>. <sup>2</sup> Ministry of Labor and Social Policy, Women and Work, <u>http://www.lavoro.gov.it/ProgettiAzioni/Donne-e-</u> lavoro/Pages/default.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Magda Bianco, Francesca Lotti and Roberta Zizza, Le Donne e l'economia italiana, Questioni di Economia e Finanza, Bank of Italy Occasional Paper no. 171, June 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Raffaele Ricciardi, Le donne guadagnano troppo poco: rispetto a un uomo lavorano 59 giorni gratis (Feb. 28, 2014), www.repubblica.it

<sup>(</sup>UPR), The Follow-up Programme <sup>6</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW on Italy (2012),http://www.uprinfo.org/followup/index/country/italy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See supra note 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> This term is lowered to 6 months in the case of workers residing in disadvantaged areas or employed in a profession or in an economic sector characterized by a marked gender disparity in employment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> ITALIAN NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR STATISTICS (ISTAT), ANNUAL REPORT 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ministry of Labor and Social Policy, Women and Work, http://www.lavoro.gov.it/ProgettiAzioni/Donne-elavoro/Pages/default.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Maria Teresa Carinici, The Italian Labour Market Reform Under the "Monti" Government (LAW No. 92/2012), 3 EUR. LAB. L. J. 305, 309-10 (2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> In school year 2010-2011 only 11.8% of children aged 0-2 attended public nursery schools or supplementary public services. The situation is even worse in Southern regions where (with the exception of Sardinia) values are lower than 10%. Considering also private facilities, the portion of children aged 0-2 attending nursery schools in 2011 raises to 18.7% (still far from the 33% European target). Supra note 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012),http://www.uprinfo.org/followup/index/country/italy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), GA res. 34/180, 34 UN GAOR Supp. (No. 46) at 193, UN Doc. A/34/46; 1249 UNTS 13; 19 ILM 33, Art. 11 (1980).

UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme http://www.upron Italy (2012),info.org/followup/index/country/italy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Dr. Stefania Martelli, Istanbul Convention and Recent Reforms in the Italian Legal System Concerning Gender Violence. L. 119/2013 (Nov. 7, 2013).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> TERRE DE HOMMES IT. FOUND., THE CONDITION OF GIRLS AND YOUNG WOMEN IN THE WORLD (2013).

<sup>19</sup> Servizio del bilancio del Senato, Nota di Lettura no. 17, October 2013.

<sup>20</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012), http://www.upr-

<sup>22</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), Database of UPR Recommendations: Italy (2010), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/database/</u>.
<sup>23</sup>EUROPEAN COMMISSION, TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN BEINGS (2013), available at:

http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/news/2013/docs/20130415\_thb\_stats\_report\_en.pdf <sup>24</sup> *Id.* 

<sup>25</sup> Id.

<sup>26</sup> UN Human Rights, *Italy: Breaking the Slave Trade*, YOUTUBE, <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4]7JXYNjdHg#t=86</u>.
<sup>27</sup> Convention on Transnational Organized Crime, The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, G.A. Res. 55/25 (Nov. 15, 2000).

<sup>28</sup> Recommendations regarding the RSC population were voiced by Mexico, the United States, Norway, Pakistan, Iran, Algeria, the Russian Federation, Finland, the Philippines, Lebanon, Bangladesh, Sweden, Pakistan, Austria, Malaysia, Australia, Serbia, and Cuba. UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), Database of UPR Recommendations: Italy (2010), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/database/</u>.

<sup>29</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/followup/index/country/italy</u>.

<sup>30</sup> LA COSTITUZIONE DELLA REPUBBLICA ITALIANA, art. 3.

<sup>31</sup> Follow-Up Briefing to the European Commission on Roma in Italy, at 4–5 (Mar. 2012), available at

http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/italy-briefing-ec-march-10192012\_0.pdf.

<sup>32</sup> State of Emergency: Timeline of Discrimination: EUR. ROMA RIGHTS CTR., <u>http://www.errc.org/article/state-of-emergency-timeline-of-discrimination/4116</u> (Mar. 26, 2013).

<sup>33</sup> AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL, The Court of Cassation Confirms the Illegality of "Nomad Emergency" (Feb. 5, 2013),

http://www.amnesty.it/corte-di-cassazione-conferma-illegittimita-emergenza-nomadi

<sup>34</sup> International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 999 UNTS 171 and 1057 UNTS 407 / [1980] ATS 23 / 6 ILM 368, art. 27 (1967).

<sup>35</sup> In June 2013 a bill (*disegno di legge*) has been deposited with the Italian Parliament for the purposes of allowing RSC to be considered "linguistic minorities." http://www.senato.it/leg/17/BGT/Schede/Ddliter/41204.htm

<sup>36</sup> LA COSTITUZIONE DELLA REPUBBLICA ITALIANA, art. 3.

<sup>37</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), Database of UPR Recommendations: Italy (2010), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/database/</u>. <sup>38</sup> <u>http://www.pariopportunita.gov.it/images/Strategia%20nazionale%20-%20vers.%20EN.pdf</u>

- <sup>30</sup> Article 27 of bill (*disegno di legge*) no. 670 of 12 December 2013, adopted by the Regional Assembly on 15 January 2014.
- http://www.ars.sicilia.it/icaro/default.jsp?icaAction=showDoc&id=3.

<sup>40</sup> Cassa Depositi e Prestiti is a joint-stock company under public control, with the Italian government holding 80.1% and a broad group of bank foundations holding 18.4%, the remaining 1.5% in treasury shares. For details:

http://www.cassaddpp.it/en/company-profile/mission-and-role/mission-and-role.html

<sup>41</sup> Law no. 5 of 28 January 2014, http://www.gurs.regione.sicilia.it/Gazzette/g14-0501/g14-0501.pdf.

<sup>42</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012), <u>http://www.upr-</u>

info.org/followup/index/country/italy.

<sup>43</sup> Id.

<sup>44</sup> See International Covenants on Civil and Political, Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights, 999 UNTS 171 and 1057 UNTS 407 / [1980] ATS 23 / 6 ILM 368, art. 2 (1967); ICCPR, at art. 26. The U.N. General Assembly has announced that "everyone" is entitled to the rights enshrined in these documents. U.N. General Assembly, Statement on Human Rights, Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity, U.N. Doc. A/63/635 (Dec. 18, 2008).

<sup>45</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), Database of UPR Recommendations: Italy (2010), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/database/</u>.
<sup>46</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/followup/index/country/italy</u>.

<sup>47</sup> Law Decree No. 89/2011, converted into Law No. 129/2011, art. 3, letter d), which amended art. 14 of Legislative Decree No. 286/1998 on immigration.

<sup>48</sup> UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW (UPR), The Follow-up Programme on Italy (2012), <u>http://www.upr-info.org/followup/index/country/italy</u>.

<sup>49</sup>http://www.immigrazione.regione.toscana.it/lenya/paesi/live/contenuti/norme/accordo-3-04-2012.html

info.org/followup/index/country/italy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> CEDAW, *supra* note 14, at Art. 3.

<sup>50</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> See Universal Declaration of Human Rights, G.A. Res. 217 (III), U.N. Doc. A/RES/217(III) (Dec. 10, 1948). Italy has not yet ratified the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families.